

Peer Analysis

COTTAGE GROVE AREA TRANSIT DEVELOPMENT PLAN

DATE: July 31, 2020

TO: Cottage Grove Area TDP Project Management Team

FROM: Lane Council of Governments: Kelly Clarke, Rachel Dorfman, Syd Shoaf

SUBJECT: Cottage Grove Area TDP Peer analysis

Purpose

The intent of this peer analysis is to provide some comparison between transit services in Cottage Grove and a select number of peer transit providers operating in similar conditions. Though Cottage Grove is within and served by Lane Transit District (LTD), this peer analysis focuses on South Lane Wheels (SLW) as Cottage Grove’s contracted transit provider and flow-through recipient of Federal Transit Administration (FTA) funds. Through peer analysis, Cottage Grove and SLW can measure their area’s transit service against peers on common performance measures. All transit providers receiving federal funds are required to report a range of data to the National Transit Database (NTD), which are available in the form of compiled reports on the FTA’s website.¹ Peer analysis is not just a tool for self-evaluation—it is also an opportunity to gain an understanding for what might be possible for Cottage Grove and SLW in the future based on what peer agencies have achieved with similar resources or in similar operating environments.

Peer Analysis Approach

For this analysis, peers were selected based on the size of the population center in which they serve, their relationship to the surrounding rural and urban communities, the type of service they provide, and their operating budget. An initial review of transit providers in Oregon produced a list of 21 comparable providers with a federal designation of “small urban” or “rural,” most of which, like SLW, fall into the “Rural General Public Transit” NTD reporting category, indicating that they are not required to report on the full set of performance measures. The Project Management Team (PMT)² narrowed the larger list to six transit providers deemed to provide the best opportunity for comparison: City of Canby, City of Lebanon, City of Sandy, City of Woodburn, Josephine County, and the South Clackamas Transportation

¹ The National Transit Database uses standardized definitions for performance measures. However, there can still be inconsistencies in the way that transit providers report on performance measures.

² PMT members include: Amanda Ferguson, Cottage Grove City Planner; Ruth Linoz, South Lane Wheels Executive Director; Mark Bernard, ODOT Region 2B Transit Coordinator; Paul Thompson, LCOG Program Manager; Kelly Clarke, LCOG Senior Planner; Rachel Dorfman, LCOG Assistant Planner; and Syd Shoaf, LCOG Assistant Planner



District. These six providers operate primarily in rural or small urban areas, provide a similar level of service through demand response and fixed routes, and have operating budgets below \$2 million; they also represent a cross-section of provider types—city, county, and district (see Table 1).

Table 1: Peer Provider List

Provider	Category	Federal Designation	NTD Reporter Type	Main City	Main City Population
South Lane Wheels	City / Nonprofit	Rural	Rural General Public Transit	Cottage Grove	10,083
City of Canby	City	Rural	Rural General Public Transit	Canby	17,527
City of Lebanon	City	Rural	Rural General Public Transit	Lebanon	16,599
City of Sandy	City	Rural	Rural General Public Transit	Sandy	10,834
City of Woodburn	City	Rural	Rural General Public Transit	Woodburn	25,417
Josephine County	County	Small urban	Reduced Reporter	Grants Pass	37,201
South Clackamas Transportation District	District	Rural	Rural General Public Transit	Molalla	9,082

Sources: National Transit Database 2018 Agency Profiles, U.S. Bureau of the Census ACS 2018 5-year estimates, Table S0101

Peer Service Comparison

Table 2 gives an overview of the services provided by SLW and its peers. SLW operates eight vehicles in maximum service that have a total seating capacity of 76. In 2018, SLW reported serving 11,065 annual unlinked passenger trips over 95,684 vehicle revenue miles with total operating expenses of \$384,165.

Table 2: Peer Provider Service Overview

Provider	Vehicles Operated in Maximum Service	Total Revenue Vehicles	Seating Capacity	Annual Vehicle Revenue Miles	Annual Vehicle Revenue Hours	Annual Unlinked Passenger Trips	Total Operating Expenses
South Lane Wheels	8	9	76	95,684	7,898	11,065	\$384,165
City of Canby	8	13	184	223,766	14,400	75,038	\$1,679,387
City of Lebanon	5	5	65	44,085	4,812	20,272	\$312,893
City of Sandy	7	10	215	347,042	16,238	129,776	\$1,342,311
City of Woodburn	11	11	167	120,513	8,690	35,672	\$602,833
Josephine County	14	17	192	458,730	24,098	222,849	\$1,646,552
South Clackamas Transportation District	4	6	116	263,135	11,579	90,996	\$704,934

Source: National Transit Database 2018 Agency Profiles



Table 3 breaks down operating funds by funding type. In 2018, approximately 87% of SLW’s funds came from federal sources (\$390,901 of \$446,514 total). It is worth noting that Cottage Grove is within Lane Transit District’s (LTD’s) boundary. Employers within the LTD boundary pay a transit district payroll tax on wages of employees. The 2020 tax rate is 0.75%, and the rate is scheduled to increase each year by 0.01%.³ Revenue generated through this tax supports LTD’s operating budget and flows back into Cottage Grove via LTD’s Route 98 bus service and partnership with SLW. This funding source is not reflected in Table 3 as it is not part of SLW’s operating funds, but it does contribute to transit availability in the Cottage Grove area.

Table 3: Operating Funds by Funding Type

Provider	Fares	Other Directly Generated	Taxes & Fees Levied by Agency	Local	State	Federal	Total
South Lane Wheels	\$25,457	\$20,327	\$0	\$9,829	\$0	\$390,901	\$446,514
City of Canby	\$59,901	\$45	\$0	\$1,081,053	\$122,750	\$506,861	\$1,770,610
City of Lebanon	\$13,958	\$44,338	\$0	\$66,782	\$76,484	\$85,559	\$287,121
City of Sandy	\$98,994	\$0	\$0	\$297,063	\$126,437	\$591,329	\$1,113,823
City of Woodburn	\$38,226	\$67,541	\$0	\$116,000	\$151,875	\$278,707	\$652,349
Josephine County	\$122,260	\$367,432	\$0	\$73,356	\$296,191	\$867,000	\$1,726,239
South Clackamas Transportation District	\$38,527	\$0	\$0	\$383,714	\$146,784	\$260,582	\$829,607

Source: National Transit Database 2018 Funding Sources Table

Table 4 provides a peer comparison of the demand response services provided by the peer group. In 2018, seven of SLW’s eight vehicles operating in maximum service were used for demand response services. SLW’s door-to-door services accounted for 66% of its total unlinked passenger trips, 89% of its total vehicle revenue miles, and 83% of its total operating expenses. SLW served 1.1 passengers per hour at a cost of \$43.96 per passenger.

³ Lane Transit District, “Payroll & Self-Employment Tax Information,” <https://www.ltd.org/payroll-self-employment-tax-information/>

Table 4: Demand Response Peer Comparison

Provider	Number Vehicles	Passengers per Hour	Cost per Passenger	Unlinked Passenger Trips	Vehicle Revenue Hours	Vehicle Revenue Miles	Total Operating Expenses
South Lane Wheels	7	1.1	\$43.96	7,294	6,592	84,894	\$320,663
City of Canby	5	2.8	\$40.96	17,146	6,033	66,623	\$702,261
City of Lebanon	4	4.3	\$14.70	19,687	4,562	41,544	\$289,449
City of Sandy	3	2.7	\$26.74	14,626	5,341	85,547	\$391,036
City of Woodburn	8	2.6	\$16.25	14,841	5,642	75,490	\$241,133
Josephine County	5	2.8	\$32.29	16,339	5,891	85,064	\$527,538
South Clackamas Transportation District	0	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A

Source: National Transit Database 2018 Metrics Table

Table 5 provides a peer comparison of fixed route bus services provided by the peer group. SLW suspended its Route-Around-Town service starting in January 2019 in response to Lane Transit District’s Mobility On Demand (MOD) pilot. The comparison from 2018 data remains of value given that SLW will consider reinstating its fixed route service depending on the outcome of the pilot.

Table 5: Fixed Route Bus Peer Comparison

Provider	Number Vehicles	Passengers per Hour	Cost per Passenger	Unlinked Passenger Trips	Vehicle Revenue Hours	Vehicle Revenue Miles	Total Operating Expenses
South Lane Wheels	1	2.9	\$16.84	3,771	1,306	10,790	\$63,502
City of Canby	3	6.9	\$16.88	57,892	8,367	157,143	\$977,126
City of Lebanon	1	2.3	\$40.08	585	250	2,541	\$23,444
City of Sandy	1	5.7	\$12.43	4,320	756	11,222	\$53,692
City of Woodburn	3	6.8	\$17.36	20,831	3,048	45,023	\$361,700
Josephine County	4	14.6	\$3.60	173,606	11,907	176,476	\$624,931
South Clackamas Transportation District	1	9.4	\$6.95	23,968	2,547	17,104	\$166,560

Source: National Transit Database 2018 Metrics Table

Table 6 provides a comparison of commuter bus services provided by the peer group. SLW does not provide traditional commuter bus services; its Metro Shuttle operates as a demand response commuter option connecting Cottage Grove and Creswell to the Eugene-Springfield Metro area. In this peer group, only three transit agencies provide commuter bus service. The City of Canby and South Clackamas Transportation District both serve areas in proximity to the Portland Metro area, a much larger population and employment center. Josephine County, however, serves a predominantly rural population with smaller population centers.

Table 6: Commuter Bus Peer Comparison

Provider	Number Vehicles	Passengers per Hour	Cost per Passenger	Unlinked Passenger Trips	Vehicle Revenue Hours	Vehicle Revenue Miles	Total Operating Expenses
South Lane Wheels	0	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A
City of Canby	0	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A
City of Lebanon	0	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A
City of Sandy	3	10.9	\$8.10	110,830	10,141	250,273	\$897,583
City of Woodburn	0	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A
Josephine County	5	5.2	\$15.02	32,904	6,300	197,190	\$494,083
South Clackamas Transportation District	3	7.4	\$8.03	67,028	9,032	246,031	\$538,374

Source: National Transit Database 2018 Metrics Table

Peer Fare Comparison

Table 7 compares the fare structures of SLW and the six peer provider agencies. Every agency in this analysis provides some form of dial-a-ride or deviated fixed route service. Some are open to the general public for a fare and some are only available to seniors or those with a disability, usually for free or at a discounted rate. SLW’s door-to-door fares are dependent on mileage; they range from \$3 to \$10 and up depending on distance. While SLW has historically offered Medicaid/Non-Medical Transportation, it is no longer contracted through RideSource to provide this free service. SLW is the only provider in this analysis that provides advanced-request scheduled rides to and from the nearest large metro area—its Metro Shuttle ranges from \$20 to \$30 round trip between Creswell or Cottage Grove and the Eugene/Springfield Metro area. Other agencies provide fixed-route intercity commuter bus service with fares ranging from \$1 to \$2 each way. At \$1 per ride, the Mobility On Demand pilot, also known as the LTD Connector, is consistent with both dial-a-ride and fixed route services that are confined within the urban growth boundaries or smaller service areas of SLW peers.

Table 7: Fare Comparison

Provider	Service	Description	Fare*
South Lane Wheels	Door-to-Door	Door-to-door services available to the general public in the Cottage Grove area	Up to 3 miles - \$3 Up to 5 miles - \$5 Up to 10 miles - \$10 Each additional mile after 10 - \$1 (one attendant rides for free)
	Metro Shuttle to Eugene/Springfield	Advanced-request scheduled ride into the Eugene/Springfield metro area	From Creswell - \$10 From Cottage Grove - \$15
	LTD Connector	Pilot shuttle service operating within Cottage Grove city limits that connects to LTD route 98 running between Eugene and Cottage Grove	\$1
City of Canby	Route 99X	Commuter bus service to Oregon City and Woodburn	\$1

	Dial-A-Ride (General Public)	General public service available to anyone traveling within the Canby Urban Growth Boundary; available as space allows (designed to utilize unused capacity in the Complimentary Paratransit service)	\$1
	Dial-A-Ride (Complimentary Paratransit Service)	Complimentary paratransit available to individuals whose disability prevents them from using or accessing local fixed route service	Fareless
	Dial-A-Ride (Shopping Shuttle)	Free shopping shuttle service offered on weekdays	Fareless
City of Lebanon	LINX Dial-A-Bus	Curb-to-curb transportation for seniors, those with disabilities, and general public within city limits of Lebanon	Seniors & those with disabilities - \$1 (caregiver is free) General Public - \$2
	LINX Loop	Fixed route with seven scheduled stops	Seniors & those with disabilities - \$1 (caregiver is free) General public: Schedule stops - \$1 Depart from route - \$2
City of Sandy	SAM – In-Town Service	Fixed route service	Fareless
	SAM – Gresham Service	Fixed route service	\$1
	SAM – Estacada	Fixed route service	\$1
	Sandy Shopper – In-Town Service	Shopper shuttle service	Fareless
	STAR Dial-A-Ride (General Public)	Curb-to-curb service available to anyone within a 3 mile radius of the City of Sandy	\$1
	STAR Dial-A-Ride (Elderly/Disabled)	ADA complimentary paratransit rides to ADA eligible individuals	\$1 (round trip)
	ED – Out of Town Medical Transport	Out of town medical rides for appointments that can't be reached with existing SAM services (must meet ADA requirements as elderly, frail, or disabled)	\$2
City of Woodburn	Woodburn Fixed Route	1-hour loop going through Woodburn 7 days a week	\$1.25
	Express Route	Fixed route loop designed to serve the most frequented stops on weekdays	\$1.25
	Dial-A-Ride	Door-to-door service for people with disabilities and the elderly living within Woodburn	\$2.50
Josephine County	Dial-a-Ride	Door-to-Door service available to people whose disability prevents them from using the fixed route bus	JCT Service Area - \$2 Same day - \$4

		available ¼ of a mile on each side of any JCT fixed route service	
	Fixed Route Service	Weekday service serving Grants Pass with four fixed routes	\$1
	Commuter Route	Commuter service between Grants Pass and Medford	\$2
South Clackamas Transportation District	Molalla City Bus	Deviated fixed route service offered to the general public	Fareless
	Molalla to Canby	Fixed route service between Molalla and Canby	\$1
	Molalla to Clackamas Community College	Fixed route service between Molalla and Clackamas Community College	\$1
Source: Individual provider websites			
*Note: All fares are one way unless otherwise indicated			

DRAFT